

New Zealand National Security

New Zealand National Security
Challenges, Trends and Issues

*Edited by William Hoverd,
Nick Nelson and Carl Bradley*



MASSEY UNIVERSITY PRESS



Massey Defence and Security Series is an imprint of Massey University Press

First published in 2017 by Massey University Press

Private Bag 102904, North Shore Mail Centre, Auckland 0745, New Zealand

www.masseypress.ac.nz

Text copyright © individual contributors, 2017

Design by Open Lab. Layout by Kate Barraclough

The moral right of the authors has been asserted

All rights reserved. Except as provided by the Copyright Act 1994, no part of this book may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the prior written permission of both the copyright owner(s) and the publisher.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the National Library of New Zealand

Printed and bound in New Zealand by Printlink

ISBN: 978-0-9941407-0-8

CONTENTS

Foreword	9
<i>Carolyn Tremain</i>	
<i>Paul Spoonley</i>	
Preface	13
<i>Nick Nelson</i>	
Abbreviations	15
Introduction	19
<i>William Hoverd</i>	
Part 1: International, regional and subregional security trends	
1. Security and strategy in the Asia-Pacific: Challenges and opportunities for New Zealand	59
<i>Rouben Azizian</i>	
2. Challenging geopolitical seascapes: Southeast Asia and the big powers in the South China Sea	74
<i>Aileen San Pablo-Baviera</i>	
3. New Zealand and the Pacific Islands region: Change, challenges and new ideas	90
<i>Anna Powles</i>	
4. Global cyber threats and the way ahead	109
<i>Tang Lan</i>	
5. Rethinking national security: A new conceptual framework?	124
<i>Negar Partow</i>	

Part 2: New Zealand's emerging security challenges

6. The New Zealand national security system 147
Howard Broad
7. International economic security: The New Zealand perspective 165
Stephen Hoadley
8. Border narratives and practices: A window into economic security 180
Germana Nicklin
9. Air surveillance capability and the security of the
exclusive economic zone 199
Brian Oliver and John Moremon
10. New Zealand Special Operations Forces: Subtle and strategic
effect in the whole-of-government approach to New Zealand's
national security 221
Miriam Wharton and Rhys Ball

Part 3: Issues in New Zealand security

11. New Zealand's national security coordination 237
Terry Johanson
12. Facing up! The legal and definitional challenges of New Zealand's
approach to terrorism 254
John Battersby
13. Outlaw motorcycle clubs, organised crime and New Zealand
national security 272
Carl Bradley
14. Differentiating between New Zealand's two security studies
research agendas 289
William Hoverd

15. New Zealand security intellectuals: Critics or courtesans? <i>Damien Rogers</i>	308
Conclusion <i>Nick Nelson</i>	326
Bibliography	338
About the contributors	375
Acknowledgements	382

FOREWORD

What we in New Zealand think of as ‘security’ has changed. It is no longer the sole domain of our defence forces to protect New Zealand and its citizens’ way of life. Lives and livelihoods around the globe are increasingly connected through the internet, telecommunications systems and complicated trade supply chains. These connections are great — they improve our lives immensely — but they also connect us to people and groups (both state and non-state actors) who threaten our security via cyber attacks, terrorism, transnational crime and human trafficking. Other global threats, such as the complex, interrelated effects of global warming, environmental disasters, pandemics and the depletion of food stocks now impact us nationally and globally.

The speed of trade, technology and travel flows makes it increasingly difficult to detect risks at our border. Our geographical location once kept us safe; however, as global power dynamics shift and change, so too do traditional notions of New Zealand’s border and national security. We now

need a deeper understanding of security, and of how we can maintain the New Zealand way of life in the face of the changing shape of our world — within New Zealand, the Pacific and across the world. The government is experienced in responding to some of these threats and is able to plan and prepare for them. Other threats require a wider collection of partnerships and solutions in order to develop new ways of responding to developing threats, not just nationally but also globally.

This unique book is timely and important. It grew out of a national security conference and workshop that involved academia, government officials and industry representatives. It is, I hope, the start of an enduring critical dialogue about national security between these parties as well as in the wider New Zealand public.

The book offers fresh insights into some of the challenges, trends and issues directly relevant to New Zealand's national security. It situates our national security within our geographical region and amid the political and economic interests that affect New Zealand. It also engages with and challenges our national security policies, capabilities and practices, and reveals aspects of our national security that we may not be thinking enough about, such as ethical considerations or how legislation shapes our behaviours.

Clearly, there is more to say, to question and to explore about New Zealand's national security direction, what we want it to be and how to create the future we want for our mokopuna. For that we need to involve the whole of our society. This book opens that ongoing conversation — a conversation for the twenty-first century.

Carolyn Tremain

Chief Executive and Comptroller of New Zealand Customs

In June 2005, I had just left my London hotel to start my journey to Heathrow to meet my wife. As I arrived at the tube station, they were closing the steel gates. Nobody could tell me what was going on and there was no cell phone coverage. I eventually caught a bus to the airport — an airport that was in lockdown, as much as it could be given that international flights continued to arrive and depart.

Later, much later, we were to discover the reason for London's chaos — acts of domestic terrorism involving bombs on London's transport system. As anyone who has experienced these extreme forms of terrorism involving violence directed at civilians will know, it is deeply upsetting for everyone involved, whether as individuals, communities or those organisations that are responsible for public health and safety. It undermines individual and collective ontological security, and invokes the reset button. Why? Who? What should happen to avoid further attacks?

The 2005 London bombing was only one of a series of incidents that have escalated the interest in a range of security issues for countries such as the United Kingdom and the United States. The terrorism that was associated with groups like the Irish Republican Army has now morphed into 'Islamic terrorism'. Moreover, there are new vectors, new candidates (both as targets and as perpetrators) and new technologies. Terrorism is both international and domestic, both traditional (bombs) and new

(cyber threats), and seemingly endless in terms of the possibilities.

This invites the question, then, of: What constitutes security? It is exactly this question that the contributors to this book dissect and discuss. As Wil Hoverd points out in the introduction, the definition of what constitutes security is continually contested and (re)negotiated. That is as it should be. As I note with terrorism above, the possibilities are endless. But that does not mean that it cannot be defined and understood. The chapters in this book are testimony to that. The complexity of the thinking and research reflects the complexity of security in a contemporary world.

A book that explains this complexity and the nature and issues of security for New Zealand in the Asia-Pacific region is to be particularly welcomed. New Zealand is something of an outlier, both in a geographical sense and in terms of its experiences of security — or challenges to that security. But it would be a mistake to think that remoteness or a relatively safe and stable recent history means that the country is exempt from threats to security. Cyber threats know no territorial boundaries or authorities. New Zealand's geopolitical realignment away from the United Kingdom to Asia, and its increasingly open borders, present some very new possibilities — or challenges. This book, in my opinion, fully canvasses these existing and emerging issues. It provides an extension of the 2016 inaugural New Zealand National Security Conference held at Massey University, and a more detailed rendering of security in twenty-first-century Aotearoa New Zealand. I hope it gets the readership it deserves, because failure to engage with these issues imperils all of us.

*Distinguished Professor Paul Spoonley FRSNZ
Pro Vice-Chancellor, Massey University*

PREFACE

Discussions around security are intriguing and contentious. They are also important. The inaugural New Zealand National Security Conference hosted by Massey University's Centre for Defence and Security Studies in Auckland on 30–31 August 2016 provided an opportunity for government agencies, academia, the corporate sector and wider society to come together to discuss New Zealand's security from an international, national and societal perspective. This volume, arising from the conference, provides a timely discussion about what constitutes security; what today's security challenges, trends and issues are; and what opportunities exist for greater cross-society engagement in deciding issues of security for all New Zealanders.

While it is difficult and intellectually problematic to make sweeping generalisations on the contending views that arose from the conference, a number of key themes emerged: the complexity of the contemporary security environment; the interconnection of the global and New Zealand's

national security environment; and the opportunities for broader engagement to address security from a whole-of-society perspective. Although not a complete list, these themes are core issues and provide an opportunity to shape the discourse on New Zealand's national security. This volume draws these themes together and offers ideas on a way forward for addressing security issues from a fresh perspective.

Nick Nelson

Centre for Defence and Security Studies

Massey University

Abbreviations

22 SAS	Special Air Service Regiment
5SOF	Five Special Operations Forces
A2/A	anti-access/area denial
ACSC	Australian Cyber Security Centre
AI	artificial intelligence
ANU	Australian National University
ANZAC	Australia New Zealand Army Corps
ANZUS	Australia, New Zealand, United States
APEC	Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
ASEM	Asia-Europe Meeting
ASW	anti-submarine warfare
AEPF	Asia-Europe People's Forum
ARF	Asia Regional Forum
ASRF	Airborne Surveillance and Response Forces
ASIO	Australia Security Intelligence Organisation
BAMS	broad area maritime surveillance
BRICS	Brazil, Russia, India, China, South Africa
CANSOFCOM	Canadian Special Operations Forces Command
CDSS	Centre for Defence and Security Studies, Massey University
CERA	Canterbury Earthquake Recovery Authority
CERT	Cyber Emergency Response Team
CICA	Conference on Interaction and Confidence-Building Measures in Asia
CMT	combined maritime forces
COMINT	communications intelligence
CSI	Container Security Initiative
CT	counterterrorism
CUES	Code for Unplanned Encounters at Sea

DESC	Domestic and External Security Coordination
DHS	Department of Homeland Security
DNI	Director of National Intelligence
DPMC	Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet
DPRK	Democratic People's Republic of Korea
DSO	Directorate of Special Operations
EEC	European Economic Community
EEZ	exclusive economic zone
FAMC	future air mobility capability
FANC	Forces Armées en Nouvelle-Calédonie
FAPC	Forces Armées en Polynésie Française
FASC	future air surveillance capability
FATF	Financial Action Task Force
FTA	free trade agreement
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GCSB	Government Communications Security Bureau
GFCE	Global Forum on Cyber Expertise
HADR	humanitarian assistance and disaster relief
HAMC	Hells Angels Motorcycle Club
HUMINT	human intelligence
ICT	information and communications technology
IMPACT	International Multilateral Partnership Against Cyber Threats
IOCTA	Internet Organised Crime Threat Assessment
IOT	internet of things
IRA	Irish Republican Army
ISIL	Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant
ISR	intelligence, surveillance and reconnaissance
IT	information technology
ITU	International Telecommunications Union
IUU	illegal, unregulated and unreported
JTF2	Joint Task Force 2

LGBTQI	lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer and intersex
LRDG	Long Range Desert Group
MBIE	Ministry for Business, Innovation and Employment
MCDE	Ministry of Civil Defence and Emergency Management
MFAT	Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
NATO-ISAF	North Atlantic Treaty Organisation International Security Assistance Force
NFIB	National Fraud Intelligence Bureau
NMCC	National Maritime Coordination Centre
NSC	National Security Council
NSS	National Security System
NZIC	New Zealand Intelligence Community
NZDF	New Zealand Defence Force
NZSAS	New Zealand Special Air Service
NZSIS	New Zealand Security Intelligence Service
NZSOF	New Zealand Special Operations Forces
NZTE	New Zealand Trade and Enterprise
ODESC	Officials' Committee for Domestic and External Security Coordination
ODESC(G)	Officials' Committee for Domestic and External Security Coordination (Governance)
OMCs	outlaw motorcycle clubs
OPV	offshore patrol vessel
OSCE	Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe
OSINT	open-source intelligence
PKK	Kurdistan Workers' Party
PLA	People's Liberation Army
PNG	Papua New Guinea
PS-US	Philippines-United States of America
PSCs	private security companies
PSIDS	Pacific Small Island Developing States

PTA	preferential trading arrangements
RAAF	Royal Australian Airforce
RCEP	Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership
SARS	severe acute respiratory syndrome
SASR	Special Air Service Regiment
SBS	Special Boat Service
SCS	South China Sea
SEAL	sea, air and land teams
SES	Secure Exports Scheme
SIGINT	signals intelligence
SOCAUST	Special Operations Command Australia
SOCC	Special Operations Component Command
SOCNZ	Special Operations Command New Zealand
SOF	Special Operations Forces
TPP	Trans-Pacific Partnership
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNSCR	United Nations Security Council Resolution
USIC	United States Intelligence Community
USSOCOM	United States Special Operations Command
WCO	World Customs Organization
WHO	World Health Organization
WTO	World Trade Organization

Introduction

William Hoverd

CHANGING NEW ZEALAND NATIONAL SECURITY DYNAMICS

The very concept of ‘national security’ is something that is contested and must be continually negotiated.¹ This is precisely because the concept addresses a field of uncertainty and a shifting domain of concerns for a state, rather than something more concise.² This is a volume dedicated to New Zealand national security. It sets out to survey the broad, often ambiguous, domain of challenges, trends and issues surrounding securing the interests and the sovereignty of this nation state. It will explore and broaden our understanding of how New Zealand national security is constituted; it will strengthen understandings of some of the structures and agencies that enact national security; and it will highlight various areas where there are potential gaps, risks and inconsistencies for the future of national security.

This volume emerges at a time when representatives of the New Zealand security sector³ and the media have been requesting a more informed and transparent public discussion of national security.⁴ It takes a multidisciplinary look at national security, with chapters covering international relations, political science, history, sociology and philosophy. Indeed, while many of the contributors draw on close relationships with the security sector or are current or former security sector representatives,

this book is not bound by government security discourse. Rather, it intentionally set out to critically enquire how the state has maintained and constructed, and continues to construct, national security. This critical enquiry is essential because alongside the calls for improved security dialogue between the government and the public,⁵ New Zealand's security landscape is becoming much less benign⁶ and, thus, increased public funds are being devoted to the sector's various budgets.⁷ The future direction of national security action, legislation and discourse is a shared concern of government, academia and the New Zealand public, all of whom need to consider, and ultimately decide on, what sort of country they want to live in and the extent to which their government should secure the integrity of that nation.

Traditionally, New Zealand has been able to leverage its geographical isolation, its small population and its reputation as a balanced international actor to protect its national security from traditional threats — i.e., direct conflict with other nation states. Today, questions must be asked about our ability to rely on geographic isolation and our reputation to protect and sustain a safe society. This is because contemporary national security is inextricably linked to a nation's global interconnectedness, and New Zealand's interests are increasingly transnational. Moreover, the contemporary threat environment transcends physical boundaries through the use of social media and through a simultaneously increased mobility and economic alienation of the world's population. This volume initiates an overdue conversation about New Zealand national security in an interconnected world. It provides an introduction to New Zealand's national security, and offers a deeper understanding of various pertinent security issues, to inform broader whole-of-society conversations around the future of New Zealand national security. In order to facilitate these goals, this introduction sets out to do the following:

- Familiarise the reader with the contemporary security environment, and provide an overview of future national security trends, challenges and issues;

- provide a brief overview of New Zealand's recent security history;
- explain how contemporary New Zealand's national security is defined; and
- provide an overview of each chapter's discussion of national security.

THE CONTEMPORARY SECURITY ENVIRONMENT

To begin, we turn to the headline new threat potentially posed by the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL) to New Zealand's national security. The emergence of ISIL has resulted in security concerns around radicalisation and counterterrorism sensationalised as national security concerns even if, in actual fact, ISIL may not necessarily constitute the biggest threat or series of risks to this nation. ISIL can now deliver direct threats to nation states across the globe through its mastery of and investment in social media, where it has been successfully recruiting disaffected individuals to either travel to join ISIL or to incite attacks up on their own domestic population. In Australia, several radicalisation events directly or indirectly inspired by ISIL have occurred in Sydney and Melbourne since 2014.⁸ Without doubt, the Australian radicalisation events have been a catalyst for increased New Zealand national security action.⁹ Here, a series of domestic security funding and security-related legislation has been enacted since 2014,¹⁰ and the ongoing rotation of deployments of the New Zealand Defence Force (NZDF) into the Building Partner Capacity training mission in Camp Taji, Iraq, has been a response to assist with the Western Coalition's degradation of ISIL.¹¹ Interrelated with fears around radicalisation and the degradation of ISIL, the war in Syria has led to widespread humanitarian problems across Europe that have resulted in refugees spilling across borders, and to recent terror events in Brussels,¹² Paris¹³ and Berlin.¹⁴ These have renewed xenophobic views that refugees and migrants are a source of domestic threat to potential host nations. It would be naïve and irresponsible to assume that New Zealand's security agencies have not increased their domestic counterterrorism capabilities to prevent and respond to the possibility of